

# **High Temperature Stress Relaxation Properties of Ferritic Pressure Vessel Steel**

**A thesis submitted in fulfilment of  
the requirements of degree of  
Master of Science (Research)**

**by**

**Samuel R. Humphries**

**Faculty of Science**



**University of Technology, Sydney**

## ABSTRACT

Components of fossil fuelled power generation plant operate under conditions of high pressure and high temperature. Low alloy, ferritic steels are commonly used in the manufacture of these components as they provide the essential attributes of economy, creep resistance and relative ease of manufacture. Creep is the dominant metallurgical damage process leading to the eventual redundancy of high temperature plant. However, during periods such as start-ups, shutdowns and cyclic operation, the effects of load and thermal transients may give rise to other damage mechanisms such as stress relaxation (SR).

Published studies on the SR behaviour of steels have mainly concentrated on alloys used as high temperature fasteners. A large amount of reference SR data is available for steels such as 1Cr-0.5Mo and 12Cr, which are commonly employed in bolting applications on high pressure steam turbines. However, very limited SR data is currently available for ferritic pressure vessel steels or specifically, 2.25Cr-1Mo, a steel used extensively in pressure components within the power generation industry.

R5 is an assessment procedure for the high temperature response of structures. It was originally developed by the former Central Electricity Generating Board (CEGB) in the UK and is widely used by engineers engaged in life assessment studies of high temperature pressure plant. R5 requires the input of SR data to evaluate the contribution of SR to the total creep damage in remaining life estimation. Previously however, this data has been unavailable.

An objective of the research undertaken in this study was to address the situation by characterising the SR properties of virgin, normalised and tempered, 2.25Cr-1Mo steel over a range of relevant temperatures. Additional objectives, of the project, were aimed at developing a methodology for obtaining SR data from service-aged material and studying the interaction of SR and creep by a combination of test techniques.

A broad SR test program was undertaken on standard sized SR samples, at temperatures of 600, 570, 550, 500 and 380°C, to obtain a comprehensive set of SR test data for

virgin, normalised and tempered, 2.25Cr-1Mo steel. The results emanating from this section of the research will be of great benefit in future life assessment studies of components manufactured from this material.

A new test system was developed to enable SR data to be obtained from service-aged steel by testing miniature samples extracted from in-service components. SR tests conducted at 550°C on miniature samples were compared with standard sized sample tests at the same temperature. Comparison of test data from miniature and standard sized samples showed reasonably good agreement.

The effect of prior SR loading cycles on creep life was evaluated at 550°C and stresses of 100 and 140 MPa. A significant reduction in creep life was observed as a result of the prior SR loadings.

## **Certificate of Authorship / Originality**

I certify that the work in this thesis has not previously been submitted for a degree nor has it been submitted as part of requirements for a degree except as fully acknowledged within the text.

I also certify that the thesis has been written by me. Any help that I have received in my research work and the preparation of the thesis itself has been acknowledged. In addition, I certify that all information sources and literature used are indicated in the thesis.

Signature of Candidate

*Samuel D. Humphries*

## ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

I would like to thank my supervisor at UTS, Dr. Wing Yeung for his advice, patience and guidance throughout this research.

I would also like to thank Dr Ken Snowden from ANSTO who has been such a great help to me throughout the project.

I wish to thank my companions in the lunchtime walking group at ANSTO for so many fruitful discussions and I would like to acknowledge the help and support of all the members of ANSTO's Structural Integrity Section. A special acknowledgment for Kevin Thorogood, Elizabeth Budzakoska-Testone and Mark Callaghan for minding the tests when I was on leave. Thankyou to Richard Blevins, formerly of ANSTO, who wrote the software for the miniature sample test rig.

A special thankyou to my wife Vickie who has given me constant encouragement and support to complete this thesis.



## TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT .....	ii
DECLARATION OF ORIGINALITY .....	iv
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS .....	v
TABLE OF CONTENTS .....	vi
LIST OF FIGURES .....	ix
LIST OF TABLES .....	xiii
LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS .....	xv
<b>1 INTRODUCTION.....</b>	<b>1</b>
1.1 Background .....	1
1.2 SR properties of 2.25Cr-1Mo.....	4
1.3 SR and creep of service-aged 2.25Cr-1Mo .....	4
1.4 Aims of research .....	6
1.5 Structure of research .....	6
1.6 Publications .....	7
<b>2 LITERATURE REVIEW.....</b>	<b>8</b>
2.1 Introduction .....	8
2.1.1 Examples of SR.....	9
2.2 SR in high temperature pressure vessels.....	9
2.2.1 Equations for representing SR .....	11
2.2.2 The Feltham equation and the R5 assessment procedure.....	15
2.3 Ferritic steels .....	15
2.3.1 2¼Cr-1Mo alloy steel.....	16
2.3.2 Deformation and strengthening mechanisms in ferritic steels .....	16
2.3.3 Microstructural degradation in ferritic steels .....	17
2.3.4 High temperature tensile properties of 2.25Cr-1Mo alloy steel.....	17
2.3.5 SR effects in 2.25Cr-1Mo alloy steel.....	19
2.4 SR testing .....	23
2.4.1 SR testing standards .....	23
2.4.2 SR test methodology .....	24
2.4.3 SR testing machines .....	26
2.4.4 Extensometry.....	27
2.4.5 Temperature measurement and control .....	27
2.5 Miniature sample testing .....	27
2.5.1 Miniature samples in creep testing.....	28
2.5.2 Comparison of creep tests using standard and miniature samples.....	31
<b>3 EXPERIMENTAL PROCEDURE.....</b>	<b>33</b>
3.1 Overview of the experimental program .....	33
3.2 Test material.....	33
3.2.1 Test sample preparation .....	34
3.3 Mechanical testing at ambient temperature.....	34
3.3.1 Hardness testing .....	35
3.3.2 Tensile testing .....	35
3.4 Mechanical testing at high temperature .....	36
3.4.1 Tensile testing .....	36

3.4.2	High temperature extensometry .....	38
3.4.3	Determination of the effective gauge length (EGL) .....	38
3.5	SR testing of standard sized samples .....	40
3.5.1	Testing standards.....	40
3.5.2	Design of standard test samples .....	40
3.5.3	SR tests on standard test samples.....	41
3.6	Miniature sample SR tests.....	43
3.6.1	Overview of the miniature sample SR testing .....	43
3.6.2	Design of the test system.....	44
3.6.3	Design of the miniature sample for SR testing .....	46
3.6.4	Design of the miniature sample extensometry .....	47
3.6.5	Modifications to the SR miniature sample design .....	49
3.6.6	Control electronics, software and data acquisition .....	52
3.6.7	Commissioning of the miniature sample SR testing machine .....	54
3.6.8	Performance of the miniature sample SR testing machine .....	56
3.7	Creep testing.....	59
3.8	Post test metallography and microscopy.....	61
<b>4</b>	<b>EXPERIMENTAL RESULTS AND DISCUSSION.....</b>	<b>62</b>
4.1	Introduction .....	62
4.2	Characterisation of the virgin test material .....	63
4.2.1	Microstructure and hardness .....	63
4.2.2	Tensile testing at ambient temperature .....	64
4.2.3	Overview of the tensile testing at high temperatures .....	66
4.2.4	Determination of EGL and effect of varying strain rate .....	67
4.2.5	High temperature tensile testing at 450°C .....	68
4.3	SR testing .....	70
4.3.1	Overview of the SR testing .....	70
4.3.2	SR testing of standard sized samples .....	70
4.3.3	Analysis of the results for SR tests on standard sized samples.....	77
4.3.3.1	SR tests at 600°C.....	77
4.3.3.2	SR tests at 570°C.....	78
4.3.3.3	SR tests at 550°C.....	78
4.3.3.4	SR tests at 500°C.....	78
4.3.3.5	SR tests at 380°C.....	78
4.3.3.6	Analysis of the dependence of work hardening/softening on the number of SR loading cycles .....	79
4.3.4	Application of SR data to the Feltham equation .....	84
4.3.4.1	Analysis of the Feltham 'a' and 'b' parameters at the specified test temperatures .....	90
4.3.5	Accumulation of plastic strain with SR loading cycles .....	94
4.3.6	SR testing of miniature samples.....	96
4.3.6.1	SR tests on miniature samples at 550°C .....	96
4.3.6.2	SR tests on miniature samples at 600°C .....	97
4.3.7	Application of the miniature sample SR data to the Feltham equation.	100
4.4	Creep testing.....	103
4.4.1	Overview of creep testing .....	103
4.4.2	Creep tests on virgin test material .....	103
4.4.3	Creep tests on post SR tested samples .....	105
4.4.4	Effect of repeated SR loadings on creep rupture life .....	107

4.5	Metallography and microscopy .....	111
4.5.1	Overview of the metallography and microscopy .....	111
4.5.2	Metallography of the SR tested samples .....	112
4.5.3	Metallography of the post SR tested creep samples.....	116
<b>5</b>	<b>CONCLUSIONS .....</b>	<b>122</b>
5.1	Tensile properties of normalised and tempered 2.25Cr-1Mo alloy steel .....	122
5.2	SR properties of normalised and tempered 2.25Cr-1Mo alloy steel .....	122
5.3	Development of the miniature sample SR testing machine .....	123
5.4	The effect of prior SR loading cycles on creep performance of 2.25Cr-1Mo alloy steel. ....	124
	<b>REFERENCES .....</b>	<b>125</b>
	<b>APPENDICES .....</b>	<b>129</b>



## LIST OF FIGURES

Figure 1.1 Superheater headers in a coal fired power station. ....	2
Figure 2.1 A schematic representation of SR in the cycling of a thermal power generation plant.....	11
Figure 2.2 Comparison of the Feltham, Davis and Conway equations fitted to SR test data for 2.25Cr-1Mo steel at 540°C.[17] .....	14
Figure 2.3 Tensile stress strain curves for 2.25Cr-1Mo annealed steel plate [32].....	18
Figure 2.4 Tensile stress strain curves for 2.25Cr-1Mo normalised and tempered steel plate.[32] .....	19
Figure 2.5 Comparison of ultimate tensile strength for three heats of 2.25Cr-1Mo [7] .	19
Figure 2.6 SR curves for 2.25Cr-1Mo steel at 650, 600, 550 and 500°C and a control strain of 0.2% [6].....	20
Figure 2.7 SR curves for 2.25Cr-1Mo steel at 550°C and control strains of 0.2, 0.13 and 0.1% [6].....	21
Figure 2.8 Comparison of the stress after 100 hours of SR with the stress to produce $10^{-5}$ % /hr creep rate for annealed and normalised and tempered 2.25Cr-1Mo [8].....	22
Figure 2.9 Characteristic behaviour during the loading period in a SR test [53].....	25
Figure 2.10 Typical SR curves [53] .....	26
Figure 2.11 A schematic diagram showing the extrapolation of miniature sample creep tests to service temperature of the component [48] .....	29
Figure 2.12 Chain drilled sample blank .....	31
Figure 2.13 Stress-rupture plot of miniature and standard sized sample creep tests conducted on 1Cr-0.5Mo at 630°C [50].....	32
Figure 3.1 Dimensions of the 8 mm diameter tensile sample employed in the ambient temperature tensile tests .....	35
Figure 3.2 Test setup for the high temperature tensile testing showing the arrangement of thermocouples, extensometry and LVDT's .....	37
Figure 3.3 Dimensions of 8 mm diameter sample employed in the high temperature tensile tests .....	38
Figure 3.4 Dimensions of the standard sized SR test sample .....	40
Figure 3.5 Test setup for the standard sample SR tests .....	41
Figure 3.6 Schematic of the miniature sample SR machine .....	45
Figure 3.7 Assembly drawing of the miniature sample extensometry .....	47

Figure 3.8 Miniature SR sample extensometry .....	49
Figure 3.9 Miniature creep sample.....	50
Figure 3.10 Modified miniature SR sample.....	51
Figure 3.11 Load frame showing the sample and extensometry clamps .....	51
Figure 3.12 Comparison of the standard and miniature SR samples .....	52
Figure 3.13 Miniature sample SR testing machine with the furnace open and vacuum chamber removed.....	53
Figure 3.14 Ambient temperature loading trials on the miniature sample SR testing machine on 2.25Cr-1Mo .....	54
Figure 3.15 Curves showing the influence of sample temperature on the indicated strain before modifications to temperature control .....	55
Figure 3.16 Curves showing the improved temperature control and strain stability .....	56
Figure 3.17 Short term tests at 600 and 550°C. In the 550°C test a slight temperature increase of 0.3°C delayed the strain control and subsequent load reduction .....	57
Figure 3.18 Typical SR plot obtained from the miniature sample SR machine .....	58
Figure 3.19 The location of miniature samples taken from the standard sized SR sample after 23 relaxation cycles at 550°C .....	59
Figure 3.20 Miniature sample creep rigs in Ansto's creep laboratory at Lucas Heights.	60
Figure 4.1 Microstructure (1000X) of 2.25Cr-1Mo normalised and tempered plate.....	63
Figure 4.2 a, b and c. Tensile curves for ambient temperature tests at 13.2 MPa/s loading rate.....	65
Figure 4.3 a, b and c. Tensile curves for ambient temperature tests at 6.6 MPa/s loading rate.....	66
Figure 4.4 Stress strain curves for tensile tests at 550°C conducted at two different strain rates .....	68
Figure 4.5 Stress strain curves for tensile tests at 585°C conducted at two different strain rates .....	68
Figure 4.6 Tensile test at 450°C and strain rate of $3.33 \times 10^{-5}$ /s .....	69
Figure 4.7 Initial and final loading cycles for SR tests at 600°C.....	72
Figure 4.8 Initial and final loading cycles for SR tests at 570°C.....	73
Figure 4.9 Initial and final loading cycles for SR tests at 550°C.....	74
Figure 4.10 Initial and final loading cycles for SR tests at 500°C.....	75
Figure 4.11 Initial and final loading cycles for SR tests at 380°C.....	76

Figure 4.12 Effect of the number of SR cycles on the initial, final (168 hours) and relaxed stress for tests at 600°C .....	81
Figure 4.13 Effect of the number of SR cycles on the initial, final (168 hours) and relaxed stress for tests at 570°C. ....	81
Figure 4.14 Effect of the number of SR cycles on the initial, final (168 hours) and relaxed stress for tests at 550°C. ....	82
Figure 4.15 Effect of the number of SR cycles on the initial, final (168 hours) and relaxed stress for tests at 500°C .....	82
Figure 4.16 Effect of the number of SR cycles on the initial, final (168 hours) and relaxed stress for tests at 380°C .....	83
Figure 4.17 The dependence of % work hardening on the number of SR cycles for tests 600, 570, 550, 500 and 380°C.....	83
Figure 4.18 a and b. Theoretic plot of the Feltham equation against the experimental data for the first and last SR loadings at 600°C. ....	85
Figure 4.19 a and b. Theoretic plot of the Feltham equation against the experimental data for the first and last SR loadings at 570°C .....	86
Figure 4.20 a and b. Theoretic plot of the Feltham equation against the experimental data for the first and last SR loadings at 550°C .....	87
Figure 4.21 a and b. Theoretic plot of the Feltham equation against the experimental data for the first and last SR loadings at 500°C .....	88
Figure 4.22 a and b. Theoretic plot of the Feltham equation against the experimental data for the first and last SR loadings at 380°C .....	89
Figure 4.23 The effect of repeated SR cycles on the Feltham 'a' parameter at 600, 570, 550, 500 and 380°C.....	89
Figure 4.24 Stress Vs strain loading curves for the 6 <sup>th</sup> SR loading at 600, 570, 550, 500 and 380°C.....	93
Figure 4.25 The effect of repeated SR cycles on the Feltham 'b' parameter at 600,570, 550, 500 and 380°C.....	93
Figure 4.26 Cumulative plastic strain % for tests at 600, 570, 550, 500 and 380°C .....	95
Figure 4.27 The dependence of residual plastic strain on the relaxed stress for SR loading cycles at 600°C.....	95
Figure 4.28 a and b. Showing (a) miniature sample SR tests at 550°C and (b) standard sample SR tests at 550°C .....	97
Figure 4.29 The initial three SR loading cycles on the miniature sample at 600°C .....	99



Figure 4.30 SR loading cycles 11, 12 and 13 on a standard sample at 600°C.....	100
Figure 4.31 a and b. Theoretic plot of the Feltham equation against the experimental data for the first and second loading cycles at 550°C on a miniature SR sample.....	101
Figure 4.32 Comparison of the Feltham 'a' parameter for tests on standard and miniature samples at 550°C.....	102
Figure 4.33 Comparison of the Feltham 'b' parameter for tests on standard and miniature samples at 550°C.....	102
Figure 4.34 Creep test on virgin test material (2.25Cr-1Mo) at 550°C and 100 MPa..	104
Figure 4.35 Creep test on virgin test material (2.25Cr-1Mo) at 550°C and 140 MPa..	104
Figure 4.36 Creep curves for the post SR creep tests at 550°C .....	106
Figure 4.37 Comparison of the creep properties of virgin and post SR tested material at 550°C and 100 MPa .....	106
Figure 4.38 Comparison of the creep properties of virgin and post SR tested material at 550°C and 140 MPa .....	107
Figure 4.39 Microstructure (1000X) of SR sample tested at 600°C for 4032 hours ....	113
Figure 4.40 Microstructure (500X) of SR sample tested at 600°C for 4032 hours .....	113
Figure 4.41 Microstructure (1000X) of SR sample tested at 570°C for 1344 hours ...	114
Figure 4.42 Microstructure (1000X) of SR sample tested at 550°C for 3864 hours ....	115
Figure 4.43 Microstructure (500X) of SR sample tested at 550°C for 3864 hours .....	115
Figure 4.44 Microstructure (1000X) of post SR tested (3864 hours 550°C) creep sample (140 MPa) taken in the shoulder region.....	117
Figure 4.45 Microstructure (1000X) of post SR tested creep sample (140 MPa) approximately 3 mm from the fracture surface.....	117
Figure 4.46 Fracture area of the post SR tested (3864 hours 550°C) creep sample (140 MPa).....	118
Figure 4.47 Scanning electron microscope image (500X) of the fracture surface on the post SR tested (3864 hours 550 MPa) creep sample (140 MPa) .....	118
Figure 4.48 Microstructure (1000X) of the post SR tested (3864 hours 550°C) creep sample (100 MPa) taken in the shoulder region.....	119
Figure 4.49 Microstructure (1000X) of the post SR tested (3864 hours 550°C) creep sample (100 MPa) in an area apromimately 4.6 mm behind the fracture surface .....	120
Figure 4.50 Microstructure (1000X) of the post SR tested (3864 hours 550°C) creep sample (100 MPa) in an area apromimately 0.3 mm behind the fracture surface .....	120

Figure 4.51 Fracture area (50X) of the post SR tested (3864 hours 550°C) creep sample (100 MPa) .....	121
---	-----

## LIST OF TABLES

Table 2.1 Comparison of the extrapolation methods employed by McCarthy <i>et al</i> .....	13
Table 2.2 National standards for SR testing .....	24
Table 2.3 Comparison of miniature and standard sized sample creep tests conducted on 1Cr-½Mo .....	32
Table 3.1 Chemical composition of the virgin test material .....	34
Table 3.2 Number of SR loading cycles conducted at each test temperature .....	43
Table 3.3 Control strain values for miniature sample SR tests at 550 and 600°C .....	59
Table 4.1 Ambient temperature tensile results .....	64
Table 4.2 High temperature tensile test results .....	67
Table 4.3 High temperature tensile test at 450°C .....	69
Table 4.4 Table of results for SR tests at 600°C .....	72
Table 4.5 Table of results for SR tests at 570°C .....	73
Table 4.6 Table of results for SR tests at 550°C .....	74
Table 4.7 Table of results for SR tests at 500°C .....	75
Table 4.8 Table of results for SR tests at 380°C .....	76
Table 4.9 Feltham 'a' and 'b' parameters for SR tests at 600°C shown with the corresponding R correlation coefficients .....	85
Table 4.10 Feltham 'a' and 'b' parameters for SR tests at 570°C shown with the corresponding R correlation coefficients. ....	86
Table 4.11 Feltham 'a' and 'b' parameters for SR tests at 550°C shown with the corresponding R correlation coefficients .....	87
Table 4.12 Feltham 'a' and 'b' parameters for SR tests at 500°C shown with the corresponding R correlation coefficients .....	88
Table 4.13 Feltham 'a' and 'b' parameters for SR tests at 380°C shown with the corresponding R correlation coefficients .....	89
Table 4.14 SR test results for the initial and second loading cycles on miniature and standard sized samples at 550°C .....	97
Table 4.15 SR test results for initial, second and third loading cycles on the miniture sample at 600°C .....	99



Table 4.16 Test results for standard sized sample SR loading cycles 11, 12 and 13 at 600°C .....	100
Table 4.17 Derived Feltham ' <i>a</i> ' and ' <i>b</i> ' parameters for miniature samples SR tests at 550°C shown with the corresponding R correlation coefficients .....	101
Table 4.18 Table of results for the post SR creep tests .....	105
Table 4.19 Comparision of published and test data for times to reach total strains at 550°C .....	108
Table 4.20 Comparision of published and test data for creep tests at 550°C .....	108
Table 4.21 Percentage reduction in creep life for post SR tested samples at 550°C ....	108
Table 4.22 Equivalent steady state creep test derived from BS PD6525.....	110
Table 4.23 Comparision of consumed life fraction for steady state creep from reference data and post SR creep tests .....	111
Table 4.24 Summary of the test samples examined by optical microscopy .....	112
Table 4.25 The Neubauer and Wedel classification of creep damage .....	112

## LIST OF SYMBOLS AND ABBREVIATIONS

### Symbols

$E$	Young's Modulus
$N$	cycle number
$T$	Temperature
$t$	time
$t_f$	final time (SR test)
$t_0$	zero time at start of SR test
$t_r$	time to rupture
$t_{r(ime)}$	time to rupture (Inst Mech Eng [5])
$t_{SR}$	total SR time
$t_{2.5\% \epsilon}$	time to reach 2.5% strain (test data)
$t_{2.5\% \epsilon(ime)}$	time to reach 2.5% strain (Inst Mech Eng [5])
$\epsilon_e$	elastic strain
$\epsilon_i$	initial (control) strain SR test
$\epsilon_p$	plastic strain
$\epsilon_T$	total strain
$\sigma$	stress (instantaneous stress at time $t$ )
$\sigma_o$	initial stress
$\sigma_f$	final stress at time $t$
$\sigma_r$	relaxed stress ( $\sigma_o - \sigma$ )
$\sigma_y$	yield stress

## Abbreviations

EGL	effective gauge length
GL	gauge length
SR	stress relaxation
LCF	low cycle fatigue